



MINUTES

Meeting: **Planning Committee**

Date: Friday 11 November 2016 at 10.00 am

Venue: Board Room, Aldern House, Baslow Road, Bakewell

Chair: Mr P Ancell

Present: Cllr D Birkinshaw, Cllr P Brady, Cllr D Chapman, Cllr Mrs C Howe, Cllr H Laws, Ms S McGuire, Cllr J Macrae, Cllr Mrs K Potter, Cllr Mrs L C Roberts, Cllr Mrs J A Twigg and Cllr D Williams

Cllr A McCloy and Cllr F J Walton attended to observe and speak but not vote.

Apologies for absence: Cllr C Carr, Cllr A Hart and Mr R Helliwell.

142/16 CHAIR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Chair stated that as it was Remembrance Day the fire alarm bell would sound at 11.00am and again at 11.02am to enable the Committee to hold a 2 minute silence.

143/16 MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

The minutes of the last meeting of the Planning Committee held on 14 October 2016 were approved as a correct record.

144/16 MEMBERS DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Item 6

Cllr D Chapman declared a personal interest as he had attended the RHS Chatsworth show launch on behalf of the Authority.

Ms S McGuire declared a personal interest as she had received an invitation to attend the RHS Chatsworth show launch but had declined to attend.

Cllr J Macrae declared a personal interest as he was a member of the RHS and was Deputy Chair of Tatton Park Board, Chair of Tatton Park Enterprise Ltd, host of RHS Flower Show, Tatton Park.

Cllr Mrs K Potter declared a personal interest as she had asked Rowsley Parish Council clerk to send 2 letters to Chatsworth – 1 on behalf of herself and 1 from a Mr Fowkes regarding the traffic problems experienced in Rowsley.

Cllr Mrs L Roberts declared a personal interest as she was in receipt of hospitality from the Duke and Duchess of Devonshire in her role as Chair of the Authority.

Cllr Mrs J A Twigg declared a personal interest as she had attend the RHS Chatsworth show launch and had also attended meetings of the DMO which had discussed the show.

Item 8

The following Members declared they had received a letter and a brochure from the applicants: Mr P Ancell, Cllr P Brady, Cllr Mrs C Howe, Cllr H Laws, Cllr A McCloy, Ms S McGuire, Cllr J Macrae, Cllr Mrs K Potter, Cllr Mrs L Roberts, Cllr Mrs J A Twigg and Cllr D Williams.

Cllr Mrs K Potter declared a personal interest as she had asked Stoney Middleton Parish Council if they had any problems with the proposed windows.

Item 9

Cllr Mrs K Potter, on her return from holiday yesterday, had found she had received a letter from Curbar Parish Council which passed to the Director of Conservation and Planning at the meeting.

Items 12 and 13

The following Members declared they had received a letter from the applicant: Cllr P Brady, Cllr D Birkinshaw, Cllr D Chapman, Cllr Mrs C Howe, Cllr J Macrae, Cllr Mrs K Potter, Cllr Mrs L Roberts, Cllr Mrs J A Twigg and Cllr D Williams

Item 14

Cllr P Brady declared a disclosable pecuniary interest as he was one of the joint owners of the site. Cllr Brady would leave the room during discussion of this item.

145/16 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Ten members of the public were present to make representations to the Committee.

146/16 FULL APPLICATION - TEMPORARY USE OF LAND FOR A HORTICULTURAL SHOW, INCLUDING THE ERECTION OF TEMPORARY STRUCTURES, ON A YEARLY BASIS, WITH ASSOCIATED OPERATIONAL DEVELOPMENT, RIVER CROSSINGS AND OTHER FEATURES AND THE CREATION OF TEMPORARY SHOW GARDENS, CHATSWORTH HOUSE, CHATSWORTH

It was noted that Members had visited the site on the previous day.

The Planning officer reported that since the report was written a further letter of support had been received. The letter was from Royal Hospital, Chelsea and was summarised for the Committee. He also set out in more detail the letters of support that were referred to in the report. The Planning officer recommended an additional condition to the recommendation regarding submission of a scheme of ecological monitoring as requested by the Environment Agency. Officers felt that a 3 year permission would allow the Authority to retain some control and monitoring and enable them to work with the applicant on any issues that arose from the operation of the show. Officers noted that Section 66 of Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 establishes

that any harm to Listed Buildings gives rise to a presumption in favour of refusal and requires clear and convincing justification. As the harm is considered by Historic England to be "less than substantial", the Authority can weigh this harm against the public benefits of the proposal.

The following persons spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme:

- Mr R Reynolds, Chatsworth House Trust, Supporter
- Mr O Jessop, Archaeologist, Supporter
- Mr J Beresford, local resident and supporter
- Ms S Biggs, Director General, Royal Horticultural Society, for the applicant.

Cllr Mrs K Potter declared a personal interest as a local bed and breakfast owner.

In response to Members' queries it was noted that the applicant was unwilling to consider an alternative, less sensitive site within Chatsworth Park.

A motion for approval subject to conditions, including the extra condition regarding ecological monitoring, but for a period of 10 years was moved and seconded.

Members were mindful of the National Park's statutory purposes and the impacts on the site but considered that with a personal consent to the applicant and conditions including traffic controls and a liaison committee the public benefits of the proposal would outweigh the harms. The Committee considered that there would public benefits in respect of income that would be spent on maintaining and restoring heritage assets at Chatsworth, the benefits to the local economy and the educational benefits to visitors to the show.

The Director of Conservation and Planning stated that if Members were minded to approve the application a condition requiring the submission of an annual management plan to be submitted and agreed in writing with the Authority would be needed, also conditions regarding annual monitoring of the ecology and archaeology impacts, traffic controls including for construction traffic and the setting up of a liaison committee.

The motion for approval for 10 years subject to conditions was voted on and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

- 1. Temporary permission for ten years, personal to the RHS.**
- 2. Development to be carried out in accordance with the specified amended plans, subject to the conditions below:**

Archaeology

- 3. Written scheme of archaeological works to be submitted and agreed and thereafter implemented.**
- 4. Programme of archaeological monitoring to be submitted and agreed and thereafter implemented.**
- 5. Limit on excavations above the 'Cana Duck pond'.**
- 6. Details of the temporary bridge foundations and footings and bridge deck clearance height to be submitted and agreed and thereafter implemented.**
- 7. Detailed show removal and site restoration scheme to be submitted and agreed and thereafter implemented.**

8. A scheme of details of dimensions, depth and location of all required groundworks to be submitted and agreed and thereafter implemented.
9. A scheme of details of the Hay Meadows Project exhibition to be submitted and agreed and thereafter implemented.
10. A scheme of details of the means of securing the structures on the site to be submitted and agreed and thereafter implemented.

Conservation and Landscape

11. A scheme of details of the perimeter show site fencing, including any draping, to be submitted and agreed and thereafter implemented.

Highways

12. Traffic Management Plan, including construction traffic, to be submitted and agreed and thereafter implemented.
13. Temporary car parking provision as shown on the submitted plans to be provided throughout the show period.
14. No other events to take place at Chatsworth during the show week.

Flood Risk

15. The development shall be carried out in full accordance with the mitigation measures identified within the submitted Flood Risk Assessment.
16. Submit, agree and implement scheme to show detailed information of the temporary bridge crossings across the River Derwent.
17. Scheme of Ecological monitoring of site as requested by the Environment Agency.

Monitoring and Review

18. A Liaison Committee to be set up to include the Parish Councils.
19. An Annual Management Plan to be submitted to and approved by the Authority, to include a review and assessment of the impact of the show and measures to address any issues arising.

The meeting was adjourned for a short break at 1155 and reconvened at 1200.

147/16 FULL APPLICATION - RETENTION OF SPA IN BASEMENT WITH NEW ENTRANCE AREA AND CONVERSION OF UPPER FLOORS INTO TWO APARTMENTS AND SIX TOWNHOUSES AT SPA BUILDING, RUTLAND MEWS, BAKEWELL

The following spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme:

- Mr D Oulsnam, Agent.

The recommendation for approval subject to conditions was moved and seconded. An amendment to condition 3 to restrict the use to a health spa and ancillary café only was agreed. The motion was then voted on and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

1. 3 year implementation time limit.
2. Adopt amended plans.
3. The basement of the premises shall be used for a health spa and ancillary café and for no other purposes (including any other purpose in Class D2 of the schedule to the Town and Country Planning (Use

Classes) Order 1987 or in any order revoking and re-enacting that order).

4. The spa shall be open to customers no earlier than 9am and no later than 8pm on any one day.
5. Hard and soft landscaping scheme to be submitted and agreed in writing. Thereafter the scheme shall be fully implemented.
6. All mitigation measures detailed in the submitted flood risk assessment to be carried out prior to first occupation of the development hereby approved, including that finished floor levels shall be set no lower than 120.80m above Ordnance Datum (AOD).
7. The premises the subject of the application shall not be taken into use/occupied until the proposed footbridge and linking footway have been provided in accordance with approved drawing numbers 15/07/1A and 15/07/2.
8. The premises the subject of the application shall not be taken into use/occupied until on-site parking (including secure covered cycle parking) has been provided in accordance with the application drawings and maintained thereafter free from any impediment to its designated use.
9. Remove permitted development rights for alterations, extensions, outbuildings and boundaries.
10. Details of the finish for the steelwork, the design and finish of the balustrading and timber decking and the materials for the footpath surfacing shall be submitted and agreed. Thereafter the bridge and path shall be constructed in accordance with the agreed details.
11. New window and door frames to be dark grey aluminium in accordance with submitted sample.
12. All new window and door frames to be recessed a minimum of 100mm (approx. 4 inches) from the external face of the wall.
13. Rooflights to be fitted flush with the roofslope.
14. All pipework to be internal.
15. Details of the position, design and finish of meter boxes to be submitted and agreed.
16. The boundary between the external spa seating area and the residential courtyard shall be a 2m high natural drystone wall to match the adjacent walls unless otherwise agreed.
17. The existing opening on the north side of the existing boundary wall shall be blocked off using natural limestone to match the adjacent wall.
18. All new external walls shall be in natural limestone with half round gritstone copers to match the adjacent walls.

148/16 S.73 APPLICATION - REMOVAL OR VARIATION OF CONDITIONS 2, 3, 9 AND 40 ON PLANNING APPLICATION NP/DDD/0713/0582 AT ROCKMILL BUSINESS PARK, THE DALE, STONEY MIDDLETON

The Planning officer reported the officer recommendation on the submitted proposals would be for refusal, however officers had suggested an alternative four storey proposal which the applicants felt had merit.

The following spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme:

- Mr C Hall, applicant.

The recommendation for deferral to allow officers and the applicants to continue design negotiations on the four storey proposal was moved, seconded, voted on and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be DEFERRED to allow Officers and the applicant to continue design negotiations and to secure amended plans to increase the height of the Mill building to four storeys and to allow for public re-consultation on the amended plans.

149/16 FULL APPLICATION - INCREASE THE SIZE OF AN EXISTING HORSE EXERCISE MANEGE AND ASSOCIATED WORKS AT LANE FARM, BAR ROAD, CURBAR

It was noted that Members had visited the site on the previous day.

The following spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme:

- Mr N Marriott, Agent.

The recommendation for approval subject to conditions was moved and seconded. It was agreed to amend condition 8 regarding landscaping by incorporating the second sentence of condition 9 and to omit the remainder of condition 9 regarding a maintenance plan. The motion was then voted on and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions or modifications:

1. **Standard time limit**
2. **Development in accordance with the submitted plan 1606/02C and Specifications and as amended by the submitted tree protection plan '028/03' and specifications, subject to the following conditions or modifications.**
3. **The horse riding arena hereby approved shall be ancillary to and remain within the same planning unit as Lane Farm, and for private use of the occupants of that dwelling only. The horse riding arena shall not be used for commercial purposes or livery.**
4. **There shall be no external lighting/flood lighting on the site throughout the life of the development.**
5. **The surfacing of the riding arena hereby approved shall have a dark coloured finish in black rubber chippings to match the submitted specification and shall be permanently so maintained.**
6. **No trees on the site shall be wilfully damaged or destroyed or felled, topped, lopped or uprooted without the prior written consent of the National Park Authority, other than those which are specifically shown on the approved plan '028/03' for removal. Any trees proposed for removal shall be replaced as part of a replanting scheme to be submitted to and agreed in writing by the Authority. Such a replanting scheme shall be submitted at the same time as any felling proposals.**
7. **No works or development shall take place until full details of the mitigation planting scheme have been submitted to and approved by the Authority. These details shall include, as appropriate:**
 - **Planting plan (to include sufficient width of planting on the west, north and east sides of the riding arena/manege to provide adequate**

- screening in the opinion of the Authority)
- **Softworks specifications and planting schedules, noting species, planting sizes and proposed numbers/densities**
8. **All soft landscape works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details. Any trees that, within a period of five years after planting, are removed, die or become, in the opinion of the Authority, seriously damaged or defective, shall be replaced as soon as is reasonably practicable with others of species, size and number as originally approved, unless the Authority gives its written consent to any variation.**

The meeting adjourned at 1306 for a lunch break and reconvened at 1330.

150/16 FULL APPLICATION - CHANGE OF USE TO 3 AFFORDABLE DWELLINGS AT HURST WATER TREATMENT PLANT, DERBYSHIRE LEVEL

The following spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme:

- Mr Milner, applicant.

Although the site was within open countryside Members felt it was not isolated and that the building had some merit for conversion as it had a history related to water management and treatment in the area. There was also concern expressed about the third reason recommendation for refusal. A motion for deferral for further negotiations with the applicant was moved and seconded.

The Planning officer stated that no pre-application advice had been sought on this proposal and that it would be preferable for a decision to be made and for discussions to then take place with the applicant.

The motion for deferral was withdrawn and a new motion for refusal on reasons 1 and 2 of the recommendation with an amended reason 3 was moved and seconded. This was then voted on and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be REFUSED for the following reasons:

1. **No housing need survey or other evidence has been submitted to demonstrate a proven need for the proposed affordable housing. Given the sparsely populated nature of the Parish of Charlesworth and in the absence of any compelling evidence to demonstrate that there is an un-met demand for affordable housing within the Parish it is therefore considered the application has not demonstrated any proven need for the proposed development and is therefore contrary to saved Local Plan policy LH1 (i) and the Authority's adopted Supplementary Planning Guidance 'Meeting the local need for affordable housing in the Peak District National Park'.**
2. **The total floor area of proposed four bedroom dwellings named Plot 1 and Plot 2 would be substantially greater than the floor space guidelines within paragraph 7.2 of the Authority's adopted Supplementary Planning Guidance 'Meeting the local need for affordable housing in the Peak District National Park'. The development would also be set in a large plot potentially providing large garden areas to each of the proposed dwellings. It is therefore considered that the proposed dwellings would not be affordable by size or type to local people on low or moderate incomes contrary to saved Local Plan policy LH1 (iv).**

3. **It is therefore considered that the proposed development would not address eligible local needs for homes that remain affordable contrary to Core Strategy policy HC1 A.**

151/16 FULL APPLICATION - ERECTION OF WOODEN PODS FOR CAMPING AT NETTLEBEDS FARM, TOP HOUSE LANE, WINCLE

2.The following spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme:

- Mr J Cartlidge on behalf of the applicant.

A motion for deferral for a site visit to assess the impact of the proposed development was moved, seconded, voted on and carried.

RESOLVED:

That consideration of the application be DEFERRED pending a site visit to assess the impact of the proposed development.

1430 Cllr J Walton left the meeting.

152/16 FULL APPLICATION - SINGLE STOREY LEAN-TO EXTENSION TO THE REAR ELEVATION, THE COACH HOUSE, MAIN STREET, GREAT LONGSTONE

It was noted that Members had visited the site on the previous day.

The following spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme regarding this item and the following item:

- Mr Taft, applicant.

Members felt that there would be no harm to the architectural or historic significance of the Grade II listed Coach House and the setting of Grade II* Longstone Hall. A motion for approval subject to conditions was moved and seconded. Conditions regarding material details were agreed. The motion for approval was then voted on and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

1. **3 year implementation time limit.**
2. **Materials.**
3. **Details of window openings.**

153/16 LISTED BUILDING CONSENT - SINGLE STOREY LEAN-TO EXTENSION TO THE REAR ELEVATION, THE COACH HOUSE, MAIN STREET, GREAT LONGSTONE

It was noted that Members had visited the site on the previous day.

Members felt that there would be no harm to the architectural or historic significance of the Grade II listed Coach House and the setting of Grade II* Longstone Hall. A motion for approval subject to conditions was moved and seconded. Conditions regarding materials details were agreed. The motion for approval was then voted on and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

- 1. 3 year implementation time limit.**
- 2. Materials.**
- 3. Details of window openings.**

The meeting adjourned for a short break at 1457 and reconvened at 1500.

154/16 FULL APPLICATION - PROPOSED GENERAL PURPOSE STORAGE AND LIVESTOCK HOUSING BUILDING TO REPLACE EXISTING BUILDINGS AT ADES CROFT, LOWER SMITHY LANE, TADDINGTON

CICllr P Brady had declared a disclosable pecuniary interest in this item and therefore left the room and took no part in the debate.

The recommendation for approval subject to conditions was moved and seconded. It was agreed to amend condition 3 to include that the building remains as part of a single planning unit with the host dwelling at Ades Croft. The motion was then voted on and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

- 1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun within three years of the date of the permission.**
- 2. The development shall not be carried out other than in accordance with the submitted plans, drawing number 1148-001 (Elevation Details), received by the National Park Authority on 16th September 2016.**
- 3. The use of the building hereby approved shall remain ancillary to the host dwelling at Ades Croft and be maintained as a single planning unit.**
- 4. The building hereby approved shall not be brought into use until all buildings identified for demolition on submitted site plan reference 1148-002 have been completely removed.**

Cllr P Brady rejoined the meeting at 1510, after consideration of the above item.

155/16 DESIGNATION OF SADDLEWORTH PARISH AS NEIGHBOURHOOD PLAN AREA

The recommendation for designation of the neighbourhood plan was moved and seconded.

Cllr Mrs Roberts reported that Cllr McLaren, the Authority Member appointed by Oldham Borough Council, fully supported this proposal and had been working with Saddleworth Parish towards designation.

The motion was then voted on and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the area of Saddleworth Parish as shown on the map in Appendix 1 of the report be designated as a neighbourhood area, under the *Localism Act 2011 Schedule 9, section 61G.*

156/16 HEAD OF LAW REPORT - PLANNING APPEALS

Members noted the appeals lodged and decided during the month.

RESOLVED:

That the report be received.

157/16 EXEMPT INFORMATION S100 (A) LOCAL GOVERNMENT ACT 1972

RESOLVED:

That the public be excluded from the meeting during consideration of Agenda Item No. 18 to avoid the disclosure of Exempt Information under S100 (A) (4) Local Government Act 1972, Schedule 12A, Paragraph 6 "Information which reveals that the Authority proposes —

a) to give under any enactment a notice under or by virtue of which requirements are imposed on a person; or (b) to make an order or direction under any enactment".

158/16 EXEMPT MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

RESOLVED:

That the exempt minutes of the last meeting of the Planning Committee held on 14 October 2016 were approved as a correct record.

The meeting ended at Time Not Specified